



VIRTUAL SUMMIT

February 18, 2021 – Presented by Heritage Winnipeg

Traditional Territory Acknowledgment & Welcome

By Lisa Gardewine, President of Heritage Winnipeg

Greetings from Moderator

By Cindy Tugwell, Executive Director of Heritage Winnipeg

The Designation of the Bay Building by the City of Winnipeg

By Murray Peterson

- The Bay is an integral part of the downtown since its construction
- 1978 proposed demolition of two historic banks on Main Street resulted in the creation of Winnipeg's Historical Buildings Bylaw, which designates buildings, prevents demolition and controls renovations
- Also created Historical Building's Committee, an advisory committee with heritage experts from all three levels of government, planners, architects, engineers and the public
- Historical Resources Bylaw passed in 2014, modernized process, provided transparency, fairness, set time frames for decision and notifications, broadened scope of buildings celebrated to include modern buildings, landscapes and more, renamed Historical Buildings and Resources Committee (HBRC)
- Nominated list with 132 structures was created in 2014, to all be reviewed in six years by the HBRC – a very time consuming task for volunteer committee
- 2014 saw introduction of character defining elements, a list of interior and exterior elements key to the building's heritage value, generally approved by the owner prior to designation
- Character defining elements of designation building cannot be altered or demolished without a heritage permit
- Heritage permits would be required for a new addition, maintenance, alterations or restoration of character defining elements on a designated building
- City makes use of the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*

- The Bay was on nominated list, City started evaluation in 2018
- HBRC recommended designating the Bay, City Council agreed on March 21, 2019, despite owners' objections
- Designated because it is an conspicuous, iconic and well known downtown structure, associated with HBC which went from fur trading to international retail giant, designed by Ernest Barrett, important Montreal architect, built by local firm Carter-Halls-Aldinger, classical revival style which became HBC corporate style for buildings after 1926, and the exterior has hardly been altered
- Designation protects four exterior facades, metal canopy on the north, east and west facades (added in 1956 in building's first major renovation), metal base of the Great Beason on the roof, north east and north west rounded display windows, five bronze framed entrances, fenestration and architectural elements of upper floors, examples of the reinforce concrete structural system, and examples of the curved elevator lobby
- City plans to work with owners and developers to ensure best practices are followed and the building remains viable in the long term

The Bay Downtown as a Catalyst for Downtown Revitalization

By Mary W. Rowe

- We need to think about places in unique ways, about the power of place
- Never waste a crisis, what we are in across the country
- Common pre-existing challenges in Canada, exposed by COVID-19, heighten things that were already dysfunctional and disconnecting - the built environment, race issues, Indigenous issues and legacies of places that can be good or bad
- Iconic structures help us differentiate place, reminds us where we are – Winnipeg! Signal and send a message about the uniqueness of the place
- Fogo Island Inn – new building in an extremely old place, together create an iconic place – this is the potential the Bay has
- Bigger than the Bay, what is the potential for adaptation and reused in imaginative ways? Part of the bones of the city, what makes us who we are
- The environment where we live, work and play shapes us, our values, identity and sense of belonging
- Adaptive reuse can strengthen a community's attachment to its place while differentiating them from other places
- Cities are about self organization, connections – iconic places provide opportunities for serendipity and interchange
- In New Orleans after Hurricane Katerina, communities look for hubs, places to gather and have a sense of affinity, to solve problems and form longer links to gather more distance resources not available locally
- Main streets are both hubs and long links
- Need to bring back main street, bringbackmainstreet.ca
- How do we reimagine our main street assets now that people do not go to the office as much and do we need different things from our main streets?
- Similar issue with downtowns, and we need both main streets and downtowns, the ying and yang of urban life
- How do we imagine and not waste this crisis? Need new adaptive reuse and pattern of behaviour that will strengthen the sense of local attachment
- Every community needs to come together and establish their priorities, how do they build from existing assets

- Recovery needs large investments from many sources
- Need to be stewards of our places, steward of the relations important to our connectivity, channel and leverage our resources as much as possible
- How do we use this moment of global rethinking to build from the ground up?
- People will attach to places because they are resiliently attached, they have a sense of belonging, the importance of place, places are resilient
- Be imaginative, committed, work with every person, sector, organization, even those you would not think would be interested to realize the future of the Bay and strengthen it

QUESTIONS

People do not like to go downtown in Winnipeg because it is seen as dangerous and full of social problems? Is it a stereotype, perception?

- Mary: It's happening all over the world. Question of how do you share civic spaces? Social services in downtowns that serve the disadvantaged cannot function due to COVID-19. Now seeing more segregated downtowns where we want to see more of a mix, an inclusive place, safe for everyone, amenities and services for a diverse mix of people. Do not want downtowns just full of business people. Need inclusivity to return in a way that supports the needs of all, making downtowns more complete neighbourhoods. Need more services like supportive housing, long over due. Cities are complicated places with all kinds of people, but you want them all there. A challenge beyond who is on the street, about transit, washrooms and more. What are we aspiring to make happen?

Will any level of government be willing to put the money needed into the Bay?

- Mary: Federal finance committee which worked on the budget does include some encouragement for heritage. Hoping for public leadership around leveraging existing assets, the greenest building is the one that is already built. It needs to also come from the community, do not sit back and wait for the government to act, need to rally unusual stakeholders, business and creative community. Canada's economy has shifted, no longer have giant companies that would take up all the space in the Bay. How do we reimagine the space? We need to help create the options, show what is possible, what we expect, give instruction and encouragement to the government, do not wait for them to lead. Will need to be extraordinary public investment to recover our urban centers post COVID-19. We need to influence how those resources are allocated.

How do people in Winnipeg help inform decisions not just to the usual suspects on the city committee formed recently by the mayor?

- Mary: Use social media and your feet the street, vendors, people with skin in the built environment game. The Bay has tortured history around reconciliation, how can we make it part of the reconciliation process? How are the Indigenous people engaging with you on this? How do you create a collective response? Have to build from the ground up, a diverse coalition of commitment. Do not waste this crisis, COVID-19 is giving you an excuse to form bonds and create the kind of environment you want. Work with the city committee, inundate them with input and solutions, but appreciate that this is bigger than Winnipeg, we are all struggling and trying to figure this out. The Bay is a wonderful asset, how do you build from it?

Refurbishment of the Bay Downtown Building

By Robert Eastwood

- The Bay is significant on many levels, the story of the building re-establishes and reinforces the concept of place, an important part of the story of Winnipeg and the downtown, colonial history of western Canada, historic relationship with the Indigenous peoples, HBC and North West Company, reconciliation journey
- Building can be adapted and reused in a more inclusive way

- 1870 Manitoba became a province, both Metis and Indigenous people played an important role in that discussion, part of the history of the building
- Building is an anchor to the downtown, a gateway structure due to location and monumental size
- Western anchor of downtown walkway system, which goes all the way to Portage and Main and the Convention Centre – an opportunity
- New development in the downtown always wants to connect to the walkway system because of how it connects to other buildings
- Building is symbolic of historic, geographic and economic importance of Winnipeg, can play a role in telling the history of the City
- Building's location and exposure can help it be established as a public attraction, by many other significant buildings
- Monumental building in very good condition, Beaux-Arts style is very adaptable, lots of windows which are important, robust construction, largest reinforced concrete frame building at the time it was built, fire resistant, structural capacity allows for variations in the use of space, adaptable large structural grid
- Deep floorplate of the building is an issue, over 200 feet deep east to west, but robust and flexible structure allows for large atrium spaces, allows for more uses
- 570,000 gross square feet over six floors and basement, 82,500+ square feet per floorplate, one of the biggest floorplates in western Canada, the entire Richardson Building can fit within the HBC
- Mechanical and electrical systems need to be replaced, makes opportunities for energy savings, best that each floor gets its own systems to make it more flexible
- Stairs need to be brought up to code
- Study from 13 years ago found redevelopment of base building, no tenant work, would cost over \$100 million, tenant work would be another \$40 to \$50 million, would cost more today
- Scale of project needs to be understood and players need significant resources, backing from many levels of government
- Need lots of flexibility in how it will be used, the robustness of the building can accommodate it, can make atriums to light lower floors
- North south orientation of building is ideal for atriums with deep light penetration
- Potential for lots of different groups to use the building, many different functions – arts, culture, Indigenous, business, school, grocery store

QUESTIONS

Are there efforts in other cities to use vacant buildings as warming shelters or other interim uses?

- Murray: Not aware of any, but something that needs to be looked at.
- Cindy: The City does have very good vacant buildings bylaw to ensure buildings are inspected and maintained. The HBC have been good owners and Heritage Winnipeg will work with the City to ensure the building is maintained while it is vacant.

Building Reuse and Climate Action

By Mark Thompson Brandt

- Building reuse is equivalent to climate action
- United Nations sustainable development goals – we all want to strive towards to improve our world – goal 11 is sustainable cities and communities, only possible with sustainable buildings
- Cities occupy 3% of earth's land but use 60-80% of energy and produce 75% of carbon emissions
- Total global carbon emission (operational 28% and embodied 11%) from buildings is 39%
- To meet carbon targets, need to work with the building we already have

- Within a typical North America city, 63% of carbon emissions come from building heat and electricity
- The closer you focus on the city, the more impact buildings have on the environment
- Since 2005, North American cities really have not reduced their carbon emissions – need new big efforts, low hanging fruit and big catches to make a difference
- Buildings are everywhere in a city and always changing – renovated, demolished, built, additions – an organic process
- The stakes are high, decarbonization is urgent! It impacts people, finances, nature, culture – we only have about a decade before we reach the point of no return
- Existing building account for 30-70% of greenhouse gas emissions
- The solution is an extreme acceleration of deep green rehabilitation of as many existing and historic buildings as possible to turn the tide in the fight against climate change
- ITEBS – it's the existing building, stupid!
- Must focus on adapting, reusing, redeveloping, rehabilitating existing buildings
- All buildings count, the downtown and the sprawl, need to decarbonize special and ordinary places, main street and your street
- 24 Sussex Drive, Prime Minister's home – an example of how an old building can be updated to be carbon neutral
- In Brockville, Ontario, Canada's first railway tunnel left to rot, reimaged in 2003 and became top tourist attraction
- Toronto's Distillery District reimaged in 2003 – from industrial wasteland to community hub without demolishing buildings
- Need disruptive and collaborative change throughout the building and design sectors to decarbonize most existing buildings
- Historic Empire State building was given a green renovation to become a low emission building while maintaining heritage value – so it can be done anywhere
- To stop the earth's temperate from rising in the next decades, we need to decarbonize all building, big and small
- The Bay is a prime opportunity for a deep green rehabilitation that would make a meaningful difference in decarbonization in Winnipeg
- Scale, location, so much going for it, great candidate for adaptive reuse, could provide a very high level of voided mega tones of carbon emissions
- The Bay is a landmark but restrained, full of existing resources: embodied carbon and energy, cultural heritage, environmental, economic, social and urban value, local materials, craftsmanship, local and natural history
- Politicians talk about sustainability, let us hold them accountable, make use of this opportunity, a quadruple A opportunity – do not waste this building!

QUESTIONS

Creating an atrium in the Bay is always being discussed, but also dismissed for being too expensive, is there a more eco friendly way of doing it?

- Mark: Good for brining in light to deep floor plate but also good for the environment. A large central atrium allows for control of air flow and quality, a passive means of environmental control in the building.

What about asbestos in heritage buildings? What is the proper way to deal with it and is it an issue when retrofitting a building?

- Mark: Unlikely that the Bay has extensive asbestos because it is mostly made of concrete, easy and inexpensive to instigate it. Many ways to safely remove asbestos if it is there, international and

national protocols in place, not always expensive to remove. Needs to be checked out but can easily be overcome.

- Robert: Asbestos issues are relatively small and easy to deal with in the scale of this project, not a huge issue going forward.

The National Trust Endangered Places List & Tackling Systemic Barriers

By Chris Wiebe

- The Bay was added to the National Trust Endangered Places List in January 2020
- Kingbridge Centre in Ontario – a large church that was closing down, the community rallied and it was reborn as a multipurpose facility – if they can do it in a place with a couple hundred people, Winnipeg can do the same with the Bay
- National Trust Endangered Places List is a key advocacy program, shines a national spotlight on heritage places at risk, across the country, all kinds of places
- 150 places added to the list in the last 15 years, some saved, some in limbo, some lost
- List is a reactive and proactive tool, used to expose deeper systemic challenges faced by heritage buildings
- 2020 National Trust report: *Making Reuse the New Normal* – talked to people in the industry and identified four barriers, all impacts the Bay
- Cultural barriers – the industry is skewed towards new construction, still stuck in post war thinking, need to destroy what is there to build your new dream - like the Eaton's building, need to overcome our ideas about things being obsolete and better imagine how buildings can be adapted and reused – needs to happen rapidly to meet climate change goals!
- Physical and technical barriers – risk of the unknown not such a big deal with the Bay, accumulated maintenance deficit with old buildings like the Bay, a little leak in the roof gone unfixed can lead to the demolition of the entire building, demolition and new material are cheap, makes it easy to plunder natural resources, estimated that Canada throws 1.4 million tons of wood in the landfill every year
- Regulatory barriers – the Bay does not have excessive development potential, some competing government priorities, but building code and alternative compliance will be a challenge, as seen in the Fortune Block, took a lot of money to find solutions to maintain features and meet code – the city needs to help the Bay overcome resistance in building code and building inspections
- Distillery District in Ontario is a good example where the city put code inspectors on the site for the entire project to provide continuity and facilitate redevelopment
- Economic and marketplace barriers – difficult to get financing because bank sees rehab projects as too risky while alternative markets have high interest rates, rising taxes can force people out of the building, no substantial federal incentives available for the rehabilitation of historic buildings in Canada, unlike successful program in the US, left to municipalities and the provinces, good to see it is being recommended that tax credits be instituted in Canada
- The problems faced by the Bay are similar to many other buildings in the country, we can find solutions for the Bay and apply them to other places around the country proactively

QUESTIONS

Is a retrofit more expensive pre square foot than a new build? Are there more expenses with fire safety?

- Mark: Every building is unique, will have different costs to build new or to renovate. Generally speaking, a huge percentage of the cost of a building is in its structure. Stripping a building back to its structure is a major cost savings. With a robust building like the Bay, most of the cost will be upgrading windows, maybe some insulation. Overall, it will be less expensive to renovate than building the same volume with new construction at a high quality. There is also an environmental

cost – capital costs are not everything, need a more balanced approach, what is the cost of not saving this building? Social cost? Environmental cost? There is a price on pollution. A demolition proposal is a polluting proposal.

- Chris: *The Lazarus Effect* by Robert Shipley look at the cost of new versus retrofitting, for larger projects retrofitting was usually more cost effective. But it depends, change of use of a building can cause the cost to go up with the installation of lots of new services within (electric, plumbing, etc.). Regardless of costs, rehabs provide more local bang for your buck because a larger percentage of the project is labour instead of imported materials. Cost benefit scenario needs to be closely explored, especially around hidden environmental cost.
- Walter: It was estimated that it would cost \$150 million to renovate the Bay without improvements, which is only \$300/square foot, which is basically the cost of developing a shopping center. Not a scary number! People need to quite being alarmists about it.

Imagine

By Walter Kleinschmit

- There have been lots of ideas for the Bay, need to develop one idea for the application process
- It is an historic and recognizable building with a history that predated Manitoba by 200 years
- How do we start? Remember yesterday, understand today, imagine tomorrow, imagining is at the root of what needs to be done
- Hold a charrette to figure out a finically viable purpose for the building
- The destination is the sum of the building's attributes – what is the building's importance and meaning to the community, how will it meet the community's evolving needs, how to be finically viable?
- Need a big idea!
- Must address parking needs of future uses of the Bay – is it cheaper to build underground parking or make a deal with the parkade next door?
- Location, location, location! The Bay is near many other important places, historic, arts, culture, business, government, academic
- Theme of big idea: understand our past, protecting our future
- Dedicate the Bay to celebrating our history with the Indigenous people, HBC owes its origins to them, help build a more inclusive future
- Need many things in the building to make it work: interpretive centre/museum, Indigenous services, education facilities, offices, art and craft center, music training, retail, food and beverages, HBC archives, Indigenous archives, national research center
- Need collaboration between our Indigenous past and collective future
- Mix of government, corporate and consumption (rent paid by tenants) to finance this model
- A long process: lots of ideas -> workable ideas with financial analysis -> acceptable ideas to the community -> final idea
- Biggest enemy of a project is five good ideas – four too many, need to have the courage to choose one good, workable idea and stick with it
- For the Human Rights Museum, architecture was designed around the purpose, after the expectations of the building were defined
- First need to know what we want to do with the Bay, then develop a content situation for it
- Lots of other things could go in the building: memory center, world Indigenous center, family entertainment/sport center, small business center/incubation center, arts and crafts community centre, food and more food!
- Charrette to start coming up with many ideas, then focus them down to one big idea with the input of professionals, also working on parallel finical plan

- Carbon offset it worth something too!

Imagine the Possibilities – Case Studies of Rehabilitation Projects

By Michael Binetti

- Ponce City Market, Atlanta – large Sears warehouse that has become a mixed use city wide gathering place and destination
- 401 Richmond, Toronto – former warehouse now filled with arts, culture and small businesses where the developer put heritage and community before profit (did not built condos!), shows that community interest and heritage are not a detriment to financial sustainability
- Hahne & Company, Newark – large vacant department store now run by a university with arts, culture, office, residential (some units specifically for low income), dining and retail, has 24/7 activity and something for everyone, inclusive, restored central atrium and added residential tower
- Woodward's, Vancouver – former vacant department store now mixed use, the city led the initiative by buying the building and holding public consultations and developer competition, about thinking big, two high rises added
- Meier & Frank, Portland – former department store now retail, office and hotel, downsized old department store to make smaller destination retail space, have had to downsize retail space twice, willing to be flexible and change over time, built atrium in upper floors
- Carrefour Industrielle Alliance, Montreal – former vacant Simpsons department store, now mixed use, do not write off large scale retail, can still take up part of the building
- Dayton's Project, Minneapolis – large former department store, now mixed use, reopened old restaurant is bringing back to life old pieces of the department store
- Building conservancy – what if developers do not come to the table? Lease or give building to a conservancy, rent and donations used to drive redevelopment, popular model in England but also used in North America for parks, like Assiniboine Park, use innovative ownership or operating models to help the Bay succeed
- What would a reinvigorated Bay look like? 24/7 destination, inclusive, incubator, renewed heritage, green and financially sustainable – think big! The Bay could be an amazing anchor for downtown, a once in a lifetime opportunity
- Western anchor of downtown, within walking distance of many other important places, lots of different uses could go into the building

Thank You and Closing

Cindy Tugwell, Executive Director, Heritage Winnipeg

